

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
EASTERN DIVISION**

**IN RE NATIONAL PRESCRIPTION  
OPIATE LITIGATION**

**MDL No. 2804  
Case No. 17-md-2804  
Judge Dan Aaron Polster**

**This document relates to:**

*The County of Cuyahoga v. Purdue  
Pharma L.P., et al.*, Case No. 17-OP-45004

*The County of Summit, Ohio, et al. v.  
Purdue Pharma L.P. et al.*,  
Case No. 18-OP-45090

---

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE LACEY KELLER'S OPINIONS AND  
PROPOSED TESTIMONY**

Defendants<sup>1</sup> hereby move for an order granting Defendants' motion to exclude Lacey Kessler's opinions and testimony in their entirety under *Daubert* and Rules 402, 403, and 702. As

---

<sup>1</sup> In this motion and the accompanying memorandum, Defendants include Purdue Pharma, L.P.; Purdue Pharma, Inc.; The Purdue Frederick Company, Inc.; Endo Health Solutions Inc.; Endo Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; Par Pharmaceutical, Inc.; Par Pharmaceutical Companies, Inc. f/k/a Par Pharmaceutical Holdings, Inc.; Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; Ortho-McNeil-Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc. n/k/a Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; Janssen Pharmaceutica, Inc. n/k/a Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Noramco, Inc.; Teva Pharmaceutical Industries, Ltd.; Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.; Cephalon, Inc.; Allergan plc f/k/a Actavis plc; Allergan Finance, LLC, f/k/a/ Actavis, Inc., f/k/a Watson Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; Allergan Sales, LLC; Allergan USA, Inc.; Watson Laboratories, Inc.; Warner Chilcott Company, LLC; Actavis Pharma, Inc. f/k/a Watson Pharma, Inc.; Actavis South Atlantic LLC; Actavis Elizabeth LLC; Actavis Mid Atlantic LLC; Actavis Totowa LLC; Actavis LLC; Actavis Kadian LLC; Actavis Laboratories UT, Inc., f/k/a Watson Laboratories, Inc. - Salt Lake City; Actavis Laboratories FL, Inc., f/k/a Watson Laboratories, Inc. - Florida; Insys Therapeutics, Inc.; Mallinckrodt plc; Mallinckrodt LLC; SpecGx LLC; Amerisourcebergen Drug Corporation; Anda, Inc.; Cardinal Health, Inc.; CVS Indiana, LLC; CVS Rx Services, Inc.; Discount Drug Mart, Inc.; HBC Service Company; Henry Schein, Inc.; Henry Schein Medical Systems, Inc.; McKesson Corporation; Miami-Luken, Inc.; Prescription Supply, Inc.; Rite Aid Of Maryland, Inc.; d/b/a Rite-Aid Mid-Atlantic Customer Support Center, Inc.; Walgreen Co.; Walgreen Eastern Co.; and Walmart Inc. f/k/a Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. ("Defendants").

Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd., Allergan plc f/k/a Actavis plc, and Mallinckrodt plc are respectively an Israeli corporation, Irish holding company, and Irish company that are not subject to and contest personal jurisdiction for the reasons explained in their pending motions to dismiss for lack of personal jurisdiction; they are specially appearing to join this motion as a result of the Court's deadline to file dispositive and Daubert motions, and, thus, they do not waive and expressly preserve their pending personal jurisdiction challenges.

Defendant Noramco, Inc. does not join this motion.

described more fully in the accompanying memorandum, Kessler's opinions should be excluded because they are (i) conceptually flawed, irrelevant, and unhelpful to the trier of fact and (ii) not based on a reliable methodology. Accordingly, Keller's opinions should be excluded in their entirety under *Daubert* and Rules 402, 403 and 702.

---

On June 10, 2019, Insys Therapeutics, Inc. and its affiliates each filed a voluntary case under chapter 11 of United States Bankruptcy Code in the United States Bankruptcy Court for the District of Delaware, which cases are being jointly administered under Case No. 19-11292 (KG). In light of this bankruptcy proceeding, Insys does not join any of the Daubert motions for summary judgment motions to be filed in the MDL Track One cases.

Dated: June 28, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Mark S. Cheffo

Mark S. Cheffo  
DECHERT LLP  
Three Bryant Park  
1095 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10036  
Tel: (212) 698-3500  
Mark.Cheffo@dechert.com

*Counsel for Defendants Purdue Pharma L.P.,  
Purdue Pharma Inc., and The Purdue  
Frederick  
Company*

*Co-Liaison Counsel for the Manufacturer*

*Defendants<sup>2</sup>*

/s/ Carole S. Rendon

Carole S. Rendon  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP  
Key Tower 127 Public Square, Suite 2000  
Cleveland, OH 44114-1214  
Telephone: (216) 621- 0200  
Fax: (216) 696-0740  
crendon@bakerlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Endo Health  
Solutions Inc.  
and Endo Pharmaceuticals Inc.; Par  
Pharmaceutical, Inc., and Par  
Pharmaceutical Companies, Inc.*

*Co-Liaison Counsel for the Manufacturer*

*Defendants*

By: /s/ Charles C. Lifland

Charles C. Lifland  
Sabrina H. Strong  
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP  
400 S. Hope Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Tel: (213) 430-6000  
clifland@omm.com  
sstrong@omm.com

Daniel M. Petrocelli  
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP  
1999 Avenue of the Stars, 8th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90067-6035  
Tel: (310) 553-6700  
dpetrocelli@omm.com

*Attorneys for Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc.,  
Johnson & Johnson, Janssen Pharmaceutica,  
Inc. n/k/a Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and  
Ortho-McNeil-Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc.  
n/k/a Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*

By: /s/ Brien T. O'Connor (consent)

Brien T. O'Connor  
Andrew J. O'Connor  
ROPES & GRAY LLP  
Prudential Tower  
800 Boylston St.  
Boston, MA 02199-3600  
Tel: (617) 235-4650  
Brien.O'Connor@ropesgray.com  
Andrew.O'Connor@ropesgray.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Mallinckrodt LLC  
and SpecGx LLC and specially appearing for  
Mallinckrodt plc*

---

<sup>2</sup> Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd., Allergan plc, and Mallinckrodt plc are respectively an Israeli corporation, Irish holding company, and Irish company that are not subject to and contest personal jurisdiction for the reasons explained in their pending motions to dismiss for lack of personal jurisdiction; they are specially appearing to join this motion as a result of the Court's deadline to file dispositive and Daubert motions, and, thus, they do not waive and expressly preserve their pending personal jurisdiction challenges.

/s/ Enu Mainigi

WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP  
Enu Mainigi  
725 Twelfth Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20005  
Telephone: (202) 434-5000  
Fax: (202) 434-5029  
emainigi@wc.com

*Counsel for Defendant Cardinal Health, Inc.*

*Co-Liaison Counsel for the Distributor Defendants*

/s/ Shannon E. McClure

Shannon E. McClure  
REED SMITH LLP  
Three Logan Square  
1717 Arch Street, Suite 3100  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 851-8100  
Fax: (215) 851-1420  
smcclure@reedsmith.com

*Counsel for Distributor Defendant AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation*

*Co-Liaison Counsel for the Distributor Defendants*

/s/ Geoffrey Hobart

Geoffrey Hobart  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
One CityCenter  
850 Tenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20001-4956  
Telephone: (202) 662-5281  
ghobart@cov.com

*Counsel for Distributor Defendant McKesson Corporation*

*Co-Liaison Counsel for the Distributor Defendants*

By: /s/ Carole S. Rendon (consent)

Carole S. Rendon  
BAKER HOSTETLER  
127 Public Square, Suite 2000  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114  
Tel: (216) 621-0200  
crendon@bakerlaw.com

Jonathan L. Stern  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
601 Massachusetts Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
Tel: (202) 942-5000  
jonathan.stern@arnoldporter.com

Sean O. Morris  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
777 S. Figueroa St., Suite 4400  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Tel: (213) 243-4000  
sean.morris@arnoldporter.com

*Attorneys for Endo Health Solutions Inc., Endo Pharmaceuticals Inc., Par Pharmaceutical, Inc. and Par Pharmaceutical Companies, Inc.*

By: /s/ Steven A. Reed (consent)

Steven A. Reed  
Eric W. Sitarchuk  
Rebecca J. Hillyer  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1701 Market St.  
Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921  
Tel: (215) 963-5603  
steven.reed@morganlewis.com  
eric.sitarchuk@morganlewis.com  
rebecca.hillyer@morganlewis.com

Brian M. Ercole  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
200 S. Biscayne Blvd., Suite 5300

/s/ Kaspar Stoffelmayr

Kaspar Stoffelmayr  
BARTLIT BECK LLP  
54 West Hubbard Street  
Chicago, IL 60654  
Telephone: (312) 494-4434  
Fax: (312) 494-4440  
kaspar.stoffelmayr@bartlitbeck.com

*Counsel for the Walgreens Defendants*

*Liaison Counsel for the Chain Pharmacy*

*Defendants*

Miami, FL 33131-2339  
Tel: (305) 415-3000  
brian.ercole@morganlewis.com

*Attorneys for Teva Pharmaceuticals, USA, Inc., Cephalon, Inc., Watson Laboratories, Inc., Actavis LLC, and Actavis Pharma, Inc. f/k/a Watson Pharma, Inc.*

By: /s/ Donna M. Welch (consent)

Donna M. Welch, P.C.  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
300 North LaSalle, Chicago, IL 60654  
Tel: (312) 862-2000  
donna.welch@kirkland.com

*Attorney for Allergan Finance, LLC  
f/k/a/ Actavis, Inc. f/k/a Watson  
Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Charles C. Lifland, hereby certify that the foregoing document was served on June 28, 2019 via electronic transfer to all counsel of record, consistent with the Court's order.

/s/ Charles C. Lifland  
Charles C. Lifland  
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP  
400 S. Hope Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Tel: (213) 430-6000  
[clifland@omm.com](mailto:clifland@omm.com)